

Describing a Value-Centric Economic Development Approach Based on a Living Archetype: Hizmet Development Model

Dr. Fatih Celebioglu
Philipps University-Marburg
fatih.celebioglu@uni-marburg.de

Bio:

Fatih Celebioglu holds a Ph.D. in economics and is an associate professor of development economics. His research interests focus on development economics in general and economic growth, regional development and policies, regional inequalities, socio-economic inequalities, industrial clusters and specializations, innovation, and university research. Besides, he works for companies, chambers of commerce, industry, development agencies, and government institutions as a consultant and an executive advisor.

Abstract:

This paper criticizes existing economic development models, goes into the roots of the term "develop(-ment)" and by using these roots, it aims to build a new and value-centric economic development model based on the approaches, concepts, and practices of the Hizmet (Gülen) Movement. The values that the Hizmet (means "service" and "serving humanity") Movement defends and institutionalizes are universal humanitarian values that go beyond being Islamic. The movement takes its roots from Said Nursî's interpretation of Islam and presents a broad perspective for societies, with the concepts and institutions it produces.

Although Fethullah Gülen is a religious leader who defines development efforts as a kind of worship, there is a large academic research gap regarding the contributions of his and the Hizmet Movement to development processes and its conceptualization in the context of a value-centric approach. The article in hand is one of the first steps towards filling this gap. This paper prioritizes conceptualizing the Hizmet Development Model based on universal humanitarian values, determines its main pillars and components, and aims to start a discussion on the model and a new research field in the literature.

The article combines a literature review and case-based analysis. I draw on the insights and the teachings of Said Nursî and Fethullah Gülen and integrate their principles into the proposed Hizmet Development Model. While theoretical, the article refers to the real-world practices of the Hizmet Movement as evidence of the model's applicability.

This study finds that the Hizmet Movement has made concrete contributions to development processes on a global scale through practices such as education, new business culture, humanitarian aid, dialogue, and peace initiatives, using the Hizmet Development Model which is based on nine main components.

Key Words: Hizmet Development Model, Universal Humanitarian Values, Value-Centric Approach, Said Nursî, M. Fethullah Gülen, Hizmet Movement, Gülen Movement, Development Economics, Economic Development.

1. Introduction

Economic development is defined as the enhancement of human well-being (de Janvry and Sadoulet 2021), the structural transformation of an economy (Khan 2019), and creation of the improvements in quality of life (Seidman 2005, Greenwood and Holt 2010) in the literature. Increasing human well-being is both long-term and highly multi-dimensional (education, health, infrastructure, income, etc.), and it requires a transformation in all parts of the socio-economic and the socio-politic life of regions or nations (Sullivan and Sheffrin 2003).

One of the newest and oldest areas of economics is the topic of economic development and we now refer to what Adam Smith dubbed "the natural progress of opulence" as "economic development" (Meier 1984).

Although the history of economics as a science dates back many years, economic development is a relatively new field that has been in the spotlight, especially after World War II. The main driver of the rise of the development economy is the restoration of the countries devastated by the war regarding finance, infrastructure, education, health system, government services, etc. The Truman Doctrine (1947) and the Marshall Plan (1948) -the official name is the European Recovery Program, ERP- greatly impacted this process. The Truman Doctrine and the Marshall Plan would provide political, military, and economic assistance to all democratic nations (Western Europe) under threat from external or internal authoritarian forces.

As a result of historical and natural processes, approaches and models in economic development have been affected by the national and international political conditions (war, peace, cold war, polarization, etc.) and economic conditions and needs of the period that the researchers lived in. For this reason, different approaches, theories, and models have been developed. As I mentioned above, after WWII, because the general focus of development was the restoration of the countries devastated by the war, the priority was on economic recovery and the transition to sustain the economic growth of European countries. After the economic recovery of European countries, researchers and policy-makers mostly pioneered the "new" economic development, which concentrated on the development issues facing Asian, African, and Latin American nations, in the late 1940s and early 1950s (Meier 1984).

During this period, the national product, or the total output of goods and services, was the exclusive focus of economic development. Between the 1940s and the 1960s, governments played an important role in supporting industrialization and GDP growth in developing countries by advocating government intervention in the context of the Keynesian approach (de Janvry and Sadoulet 2021). The growth of people's rights and related capacities - such as health, nutrition, education, literacy, and other socioeconomic indicators - were the focus of economic development (Todaro and Smith 2015).

I will provide brief information on existing economic development models and then focus on the main problems of existing economic development models in the next two sections.

2. Literature Review on Existing Economic Development Models

Development models refer to various theoretical frameworks or strategies that guide economic, social, and political development. These models propose different pathways for countries to improve their well-being and achieve sustainable growth. I will provide brief information about the main theories and models, but not all of them.

The "Big Push" theory of economic development, formulated by economist Paul Rosenstein-Rodan (1943), emphasizes the need for a large, coordinated effort to stimulate economic growth in underdeveloped countries. The theory argues that small, incremental investments are insufficient to trigger the kind of sustained economic development needed in poor economies. Instead, countries must make simultaneous, large-scale investments across various sectors—such as infrastructure, industry, agriculture, and education—to break free from the cycle of poverty.

The Structuralist Development approach addresses the deep-rooted structural inequalities within developing countries. It suggests that development requires transforming the economic and social structures, such as land distribution, industrialization, and labor markets (Prebisch 1950). Prebisch argued that developing countries' dependence on exporting raw materials to developed countries was a major barrier to development. He advocated for a strategy of

import substitution industrialization, where countries build domestic industries to reduce dependency on foreign goods. Dualism Theory refers to the existence of two distinct and often contrasting sectors or parts within an economy, which contribute differently to its overall development (Lewis 1954). Dualism primarily focuses on the traditional sector (often represented by agriculture and informal sectors) and the modern sector (usually represented by industry, services, and formal sectors). The Theory of Balanced Growth, proposed by economist Ragnar Nurkse (1961), focuses on the idea that economic development in underdeveloped countries requires simultaneous growth in various sectors of the economy, rather than focusing on one sector at a time. The Structural Transformation Model focuses on how economies shift from primarily agricultural-based economies to industrial and service-oriented economies. It emphasizes the need for structural changes in institutions, policies, and technologies to support the transition (Chenery 1979). This model focuses on how countries can transform their economies through industrialization and diversification.

Modernization Theory argues that development follows a linear path, where countries evolve through similar stages of growth, from traditional to modern economies. According to Walt Whitman Rostow (1960), there are five stages of development: traditional society, pre-conditions for take-off, take-off, drive to maturity, and age of high mass consumption. Rostow's model implies that modernization theory aims to increase consumption capacity.

The Marxist economic development approach is grounded in the theories of Karl Marx (1867, 1885, 1894), is centered around the critique of capitalism, and focuses on the role of class struggle, historical materialism, and the transformation of economies from capitalism to socialism, and ultimately communism. It presents a view of economic development that is centered around social relations of production and the dynamics of power between different social classes such as the proletariat and bourgeoisie (Gurley 1984, Bardhan 1985). Marxists believe that development is shaped by historical forces and that the ultimate goal of economic development is the creation of a classless, stateless society where resources are distributed based on need rather than profit (Ghosh 1993).

As a socialist approach, Dependency Theory criticizes the modernization approach by arguing that underdevelopment results from the exploitation of developing countries by developed nations. It suggests that their dependence on wealthier nations constrains economic development in poor countries (Frank 1967). Dependency theorists argue that global capitalism creates a system of inequality, where wealthy nations exploit poorer countries for resources and labor, hindering their ability to develop independently. An extension of Dependency Theory, world-systems theory divides the world into core, semi-peripheral, and peripheral nations. Core countries are economically dominant, while peripheral countries are exploited for resources, labor, and capital. This system creates a global structure of inequality (Wallerstein 2011). Wallerstein's world-systems theory suggests that development and underdevelopment are interconnected across the globe. Core nations benefit from the exploitation of peripheral nations, creating a global capitalist system that limits the development of poorer countries.

Human capital—such as education, skills, and health—is a key driver of economic development. Investing in human capital improves productivity, drives innovation, and leads to long-term growth. Becker (1964) argues that countries that invest in their populations' education and health can boost their productivity and competitiveness. Human capital development is a fundamental step in achieving sustainable economic growth (Becker 1964).

Institutional Economics emphasizes the importance of institutions (rules, laws, organizations, and traditions) in shaping economic outcomes. Strong institutions are seen as critical for fostering sustainable economic growth, as they reduce uncertainty, enhance trust, and ensure the protection of property rights (North 1990). North argues that institutions are fundamental

to understanding why some countries are more successful in promoting economic development than others.

The Capability Approach, developed by Amartya Sen (1999), emphasizes human well-being and quality of life as central to development. It suggests that true development involves enhancing people's capabilities to live the lives they value, beyond just economic growth. In this influential book, Sen argues that economic development should be understood as the expansion of human capabilities rather than merely the increase in GDP. Rather than focusing solely on economic growth or tangible wealth, Sen argues that development should be viewed as the expansion of human freedoms and capabilities, enabling individuals to live lives they have reason to value.

Sustainable development refers to a development approach that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. It emphasizes a balanced approach to economic growth, social inclusion, and environmental protection. It argues that development should meet the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs (Brundtland Commission 1987).

In general, economic development models aim to provide frameworks or strategies that guide the process of improving the economic well-being and quality of life for the people in a country or region. These models seek to understand and address the challenges of economic growth, poverty reduction, inequality, and sustainable development.

What is the main motivation behind economic development models? What are the main drivers of the models? Are today's economic development concepts truly centered on humans and their values? Do they offer anything beyond achieving a higher consumption level, or in other words, a consumer society? The idea of development is ultimately linked to increased consumption. While encouraging consumption and alleviating poverty in underdeveloped countries is important, is that sufficient? Why do hunger, misery, and inhumane conditions persist globally despite significant increases in welfare? Why do some developed countries, such as the USA, have the highest Gini coefficients in the world?

I will examine the fundamental problems and shortcomings of current economic development models in detail in the following section.

3. Main Problems and Shortcomings of Existing Development Models

First, the ideas of two important thinkers and philosophers, Adam Smith and John Locke, had been very influential in establishing the modern economic system. Smith (1789) stated in his book "An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations" that "if each person maximizes his own interest, the interest of the whole society will be maximized", while John Locke (1689) stated in his book "Two Treatises of Government" that "in the theory of property, a person has unquestionable and unlimited authority and dominion over everything he owns".

When profit (or interest) maximization meets arbitrariness and power, the world's resources are always used more and more recklessly by the owners of capital and power. Adam Smith called it "the natural progress of opulence" (Meier 1984). Locke's understanding of property gives people unlimited freedom to own things and places, but ignoring the negative spillover effects of their own practices on others, and the rights of future generations. The economic models built on these ideas and principles have limited contributions to solving humanity's problems and have been seen to lead to colonialism, wars, and humanitarian and environmental disasters.

All capitalist economic development models, theories, and approaches are focused on welfare and consumption. Socialism, as a state capitalism, is not separate from this. It represents a situation where people are equalized in poverty and state administrators live in relative prosperity. When we look at the history of the economy, it seems that thinkers, philosophers,

academics, and even policy-makers rarely stepped outside this pendulum model that oscillates between capitalism and socialism. Most of them did not search for new alternative approaches. Adam Smith's emphasis on maximizing profit, combined with John Locke's perspective that elevated property rights, led to a dominance of the powerful (owners of capital) over the vulnerable, ultimately paving the way for exploitation. This cycle of exploitation gave birth to socialism amidst ideological conflicts, giving rise to a dialectic that brought humanity to a dead end. However, it's important to remember that two wrongs do not make a right.

Second, while the Marxist economic development model provides a powerful critique of capitalism, it faces significant challenges both in theory and practice. The failure of socialist experiments, the complexities of human nature, the difficulties in achieving the revolutionary transition, and the question of economic efficiency are among the most prominent critiques (Mises 1922 and 1956, Elliott 2011, Boettke et al. 2024).

Third, as Zbigniew K. Brzezinski (1993 and 1998) says Western countries have three major problems; hedonism, secularism, and materialism. It is not possible that a person or community who lives for his own interests and pleasures, who has only worldly goals and shapes his life with financial expectations will do things for the benefit of others even though it is not in his interest. It does not seem possible for such people to consider the possibility of universal accountability. According to Brzezinski (1993 and 1998), a universal morality cannot be built on these concepts. In addition to Brzezinski, other works address moral/ethical issues within the political and economic systems of the West (e.g. Rawls 1971, Sandel 2012, Hallaq 2014 and 2018). Sandel (2012) explores the ethical implications of the increasing commercialization of various aspects of life. Hallaq (2014) explains the ideas on how societies can approach governance while maintaining ethical and spiritual principles.

Fourth, due to the narrow definition of economic development, the idea that the subject of development is only poor countries has become dominant. For example, economist Albert Otto Hirschman (1981), who made important contributions to economic development, said that economic development is concentrated in poor regions of the world, primarily in Africa, Asia, and Latin America. If we shift our perspective away from merely considering economic welfare and consumption, we can observe that the countries classified as developed today are facing numerous challenges and are unable to solve some of these issues.

Fifth, sustainable development has become one of the most prominent approaches in recent years. Some countries and international organizations, such as the UN, have made significant contributions to this cause. However, the success rates of sustainability efforts have declined due to the rapidly growing world population and consumption-driven economic growth and development.

As the world population grows rapidly (currently more than 8 billion) and there is an economic system that encourages people to consume more, steps taken for sustainability are important, but will not be sufficient. The circular economy approach (Boulding 1966, Ellen MacArthur Foundation 2013) promotes recycling and reuse, while the Doughnut Economics framework, developed by Kate Raworth (2017), advocates for the production, use, and consumption of the world's resources within defined limits. Both approaches make important contributions to sustainability; however, do not offer a comprehensive economic development model.

Sixth, governments play a crucial role in the economic development of a country. Their actions, policies, and decisions shape the economic landscape by influencing growth, stability, and the overall well-being of the population. Through a combination of policies, investments, regulations, and social initiatives, they help shape the economic environment, promote growth, and ensure that development is inclusive, sustainable, and resilient. Their role is particularly significant in developing economies, where government actions can help overcome challenges such as poverty, inequality, and lack of infrastructure.

However, the strong connection between governments, large companies, capital owners, and investors often undermines the effectiveness of economic development plans and policies in many countries and is mostly against societal interests (Stiglitz 2024). In such situations, a non-governmental approach that does not rely on state support has proven to be invaluable.

Seventh, early economic approaches were dominated by models and theoretical frameworks that viewed humans as entirely devoid of emotions and values, functioning like automatic decision-making robots primarily driven by mathematics. The concepts and assumptions (mostly neglect ethical and moral values), such as “homo economicus—a person who is completely rational and self-interested”, and “ceteris paribus—other things held constant,” are a part of this period. However, while development models considered only factors such as capital, labor, technology, etc., they later addressed the effects of institutions—e.g., Douglas North— and freedoms—e.g., Amartya Sen (Mirakhor and Askari 2015). Nowadays, development models include important religious/metaphysical/moral/value-centric motifs such as solidarity, sharing, altruism, honest living, collective human progress, well-being, belonging, human rights, etc. (Mirakhor and Askari 2015). From here, it is understood that models are gradually moving towards a value-centric point.

While the role of values and religions in the economic system was discussed earlier, later economists moved away from the concept of value. For example, in his prominent book published in 1905, Max Weber explores the relationship between religion and economic behavior, particularly focusing on how the values of Protestantism, especially Calvinism, contributed to the development of modern capitalism (Weber 1992). Weber’s central thesis is that the values embedded in Protestantism, particularly the Calvinist work ethic, created a cultural environment conducive to the development of capitalist economies in Western Europe. This was because Protestant ethics emphasized rational planning, investment, self-discipline, and economic success. Protestants were taught to engage in hard work, discipline, and asceticism (self-denial and avoidance of indulgence) as a means of fulfilling their religious duties (Weber 1992). They believed that being successful in worldly endeavors, particularly in business, could be interpreted as a sign of spiritual salvation. Weber did not argue that Protestantism directly caused capitalism, but he believed that the Protestant ethic created a cultural foundation that supported the economic conditions necessary for capitalism to thrive (Weber 1992).

Eighth, as Jean Baudrillard (1998) points out, modern consumer society traps individuals in a constant cycle of desire and dissatisfaction. The capitalist production system and the companies that are the biggest actors of this system, even the non-essential products are presented as indispensable for life. This situation triggers people's desires and creates great dissatisfaction. In his well-known book, “Small is Beautiful: A Study of Economics as If People Mattered”, Ernst Friedrich Schumacher (1973) critiques the dominant economic models that prioritize growth and large-scale operations, emphasizing the importance of small, decentralized, and sustainable practices instead. Schumacher argues that economic systems should be designed to serve human well-being, not just profit and production. He draws from various philosophical, ecological, and economic ideas to advocate for a more human-centered approach to economics. He also promotes concepts such as appropriate technology, sustainability, and local self-reliance. His work had a profound impact on the environmental and alternative economics movements. According to Zaman (2024), modern economics is founded on competition, greed, and individualism, which have led to repeated economic crises and brought the world perilously close to environmental disaster.

Ninth, the linear development approach has been an influential framework for understanding economic and social progress, particularly in the mid-20th century. In this approach, the process is seen as continuous and cumulative, with countries or societies advancing through a series of

fixed stages toward an end goal, usually associated with industrialization, economic growth, or modernization. For example, Rostow (1960) defines five stages of development.

However, it has faced increasing criticism for its assumptions of uniformity, growth at all costs, and its disregard for environmental and social concerns. The approach has been criticized for its Eurocentric perspective, assuming that the development path taken by Western countries is the universal model for all societies (Joseph et al. 1990, Dussel 1993). This fails to account for different historical, cultural, and social contexts that might shape development paths.

The current situation of the world economy presents a troubling reality. We are facing pervasive inequalities that cannot be entirely eradicated, and poverty continues to be a significant challenge. Our environment is being harmed at an alarming rate, while billions of people lack the opportunity to lead a decent life. Additionally, existing development models struggle to address various issues, and a decline in values is undermining human and moral standards.

Nowadays, humanity needs a renewal, a renaissance. Can "develop(-ment)," as an uprooted concept, offer us a new perspective on this issue? In the following section, I will explore the etymological roots of the term "develop(-ment)."

4. Back to Roots of Develop(-ment)

According to the etymology dictionary, the 'develop' term as a verb has a long history. It has been used since the 1590s (from French, Germanic, or Celtic origin) with similar meanings: "unroll, unfold" or "unwrap, unfurl, unveil; reveal the meaning of, explain" and in 1750, the term had a transitive meaning "unfold more fully, bring out the potential in" (Etymology Dictionary 2023-a). The term has the same meaning as **إِنْكِشَافٌ** (inkishaf) in Arabic and has been used in Turkish. It means "to lift the curtain covering something, to open" and "discovering the human essence and revealing hidden talents and capacities" (Kubbealti Lugati 2023).

The dictionary says that in 1793, the intransitive meaning was "come gradually into existence or operation"; in 1843, "advance from one stage to another toward a finished state"; the intransitive meaning was "become known, come to light", in American English in 1864 (Etymology Dictionary 2023-a). In the 1960s, the 'developing' term was used as an adjective to describe either primitive or poor countries, or underdeveloped countries making progress in their industrial, social, and economic sectors.

As a noun, 'development' term was used in the meaning of "a gradual unfolding, a full working out or disclosure of the details of something" in 1756; "the internal process of expanding and growing" in 1796; "advancement through progressive stages" in 1836 (Etymology Dictionary 2023-b). In 1885, the 'development' term became a more capitalistic concept: "Of property, with a sense of "a bringing out of the latent possibilities" for use or profit"; in 1816, "The improvements made on new lands, by cultivation, and the erection of buildings"; and since 1902, "state of economic advancement" (Etymology Dictionary 2023-b).

'Develop' as a term, which in the sense used in the 1750s meant to reveal the potential and hidden talents within a person, offers an important perspective for us today. In the development process, it is important for people to discover themselves and reveal their hidden talents through education. In addition, uncovering and developing the values that make a person being human is crucial. The values that make a person human may differ according to societies' cultural, ethical, and moral frameworks, but some main values are accepted universally. These values enable individuals to live more meaningfully, fairly, and responsibly. Human values are inherent in every human being and like a precious ore, have the potential to be unearthed, processed, and make people valuable.

Fascist, oppressive, and anti-democratic regimes do not allow people and societies to discover their talents and humanitarian values. These regimes prevent the development of the human essence.

The strong connection between the first element of the model presented in this paper "Developing human internal core abilities" and the historical and etymological origins of the term "develop" is crucial.

5. Why do We Need a Value-Centric Development Model?

As mentioned before, using the concept of value in economics is not new. For example, some economists define economics as a moral science (e.g. Keynes 1931 and 1936, Atkinson 2009, Klamer 2018). In this case, values play a crucial role in defining economics as a moral science. Related to this reality, Klamer (2018) states that characterizing economics as the field that examines the fulfillment of values is the initial step in understanding economics as a discipline concerned with morality.

According to Klamer (2023),

“Economic is any action that is directed at the realization of values; the economy comprises all practices geared towards the realization of values. Economics is the science that studies such practices.”

Approaches such as "value-centered", "value-centric", "value-based", and "value-focused" have been the subject of economics research. For example, Randmaa et al. (2011) focus on a value-centric model of product, service, and business development. Klamer (2016 and 2020) works on social goods, cultural goods, shared goods, willingness to contribute, and culture in the context of a value-based approach. Garrison and Towse (2017) analyze value-based pricing and reimbursement in personalized healthcare. However, these papers only focus on a part of economic theory and don't include comprehensive economic development models.

On the other hand, there are also models developed as alternatives to existing economic systems and models. For instance, the Protestant ethic (Weber 1992), Islamic economics (Khan 1994, Kuran 1995), homo-Islamicus (Farooq 2011), human economy/economics (Casagrande 2023, Klamer 2023), humanomics (Smith & Wilson 2019), humanist economics (Bowen 1972, Novak 1997, Beaudreau 2012), shared values (Porter and Kramer 2011), etc. These models and approaches are either based on only one religion or religious sect (denomination), or focus on human behavior in the context of behavioral economics, or only deal with a certain subject area (for example, innovation) within the current economic system. Therefore, we can say that they do not present a sufficiently comprehensive development model.

The term "value-based development model" is observed very limitedly in the literature. One of them is expressed by Upreti (2023). However, he mostly focuses on sustainable development and environmental sustainability. He says;

“The value-based development model emphasizes the necessity of safeguarding ecosystem health, maintaining critical ecological processes and services, preserving resilience, and ensuring the sustainable utilization of natural resources while staying within the regenerative biocapacity of our planet. Such a model holds promise as a viable approach toward “sustainable development” and “sustainable living” on planet Earth.”

The value-centric approach discussed in this article is much broader, more inclusive, and more holistic than the definitions in the literature. It is important to present a model that is not only theoretical but also right now being lived. This is where the scientific studies in the literature fundamentally differ from the model described in this article.

6. Methodology

For many years, I have had the opportunity to talk to the members of the Hizmet Movement, observe its institutional structure, read the publications (books, newspapers, magazines, etc.), and examine activities it carries out for the benefit of society. This experience is not limited to my own country, Turkey, but I have also observed the movement's activities in many countries. I have visited the movement's institutions in Turkey and other countries and met with its members in person. I read hundreds of books and academic articles on the movement, M. Fethullah Gülen, and Said Nursî. Before writing the article, I interviewed some of the representatives of the movement.

As a theoretical model development research, the article combines a comprehensive literature review and case-based analysis. By combining direct observations, interviews, extensive literature reviews, and real-world cases, I ensure a deep understanding of the movement's structure, its practices, and its substantial impacts on the development process. Furthermore, I have integrated the insights and the teachings of Said Nursî and Fethullah Gülen into my proposed Hizmet Development Model. This integration serves as a bridge that connects theoretical foundations with practical applications, offering a distinctive viewpoint on development that emphasizes humanitarian values, along with spiritual and ethical principles, rather than merely adhering to traditional economic frameworks.

By linking traditional notions of development to humanitarian universal values, this model addresses the limitations of existing economic development frameworks and advocates for a holistic and value-centric approach.

Why do I use the term "economic development" but not "development economics" in this paper? In essence, Development Economics is the academic study and theoretical analysis of the processes, policies, and challenges of development, while Economic Development refers to the actual process of improving economic conditions in a country or region. "Development economics" is mostly interested in underdeveloped or developing countries (usually the Global South). It investigates how these countries will reach a higher level of income, consumption, and welfare. However, "economic development" focuses more on current problems and the current process of development in a country or region. In this context, the Hizmet Development Model does not only appeal to underdeveloped and developing countries. This model also has useful suggestions and contributions to offer for countries that are defined as developed countries today.

7. Pioneering Ideas and Theoretical Perspective: The Approach of Said Nursî

Bediüzzaman Said Nursî shared numerous valuable ideas and analyses in his books. However, I will present his four ideas relevant to the subject of this article here.

First, the diagnostics, fundamental principles, and solutions presented by Bediüzzaman Said Nursî (1911) during his sermon at the Umayyad Mosque in Damascus in 1911, when he was in his 30s, are very similar to contemporary economic development literature. As though Said Nursî was addressing from the pulpit both the audience of his time and today's world and even future generations.

Said Nursî mentioned the fundamental problems in Islamic societies in the early 1900s and expressed his diagnoses and solutions for overcoming backwardness with a comprehensive analysis. His three fundamental diagnoses are crucial: Ignorance, Poverty, and Conflict (Nursî 1911).

In contemporary economic development literature, the concepts of 'talent, technology, and tolerance', defined as the 3Ts of economic development, are important (e.g. Florida 2002, Martin Prosperity Institute 2009, Hansen 2007).

Establishing connections between two groups of concepts after a century is essential: developing people's skills (talent) through education to overcome ignorance, adopting technology-based production methods to alleviate poverty, and resolving social conflicts through tolerance. Understanding the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals as an expansion of these concepts is also possible.

The second point focuses on repairing the citadel of humanity. Nursî (2024) says;

“The Risale-i Nur is not only repairing some minor damage or some small house; it is repairing vast damage and the all-embracing citadel which contains Islam, the stones of which are the size of mountains.”

This approach of Said Nursî is interpreted by M. Fethullah Gülen as follows: This citadel being repaired can be called the citadel of humanity (Gülen 2018-a). The restoration of humanity's citadel relies on the revival of human values. This theme can be observed in the works of both Said Nursî and M. Fethullah Gülen. The following sections will discuss this subject in greater detail.

Third, Bediüzzaman Said Nursî rejects individualism, which means thinking only about oneself and not giving importance to others. Nursî (1911) says:

“For a person’s value is relative to his endeavour. If a person’s endeavour is his nation, that person forms a miniature nation on his own. (...) If a man’s endeavour is limited to himself, he is not a human being, for human beings are by nature civilized. Man is compelled to consider his fellow humans. His personal life continues through social life. For example, how many hands is he in need of to eat one load of bread, and in return for it how many hands does he in effect kiss? And how many factories is he connected to through the clothes that he wears? You make the comparison! Since he cannot survive with only skin like an animal, and is by nature connected to his fellow humans, and is compelled to pay them an immaterial price, by his nature, he maintains civilization. One who confines his view to his personal benefits abandons his humanity, and becomes an iniquitous animal lacking all innocence. If nothing happens as a consequence and he has an authentic excuse, that is an exception!”

Fourth, Nursî (2021) emphasizes the concepts of “frugality, contentment, extravagance, greed, dissatisfaction, and wastefulness” in the Nineteenth Flash (on Frugality) of his famous book “The Flashes.” He considers these concepts as a result of human responsibilities towards his/her creator, his/her body, and the society he/she lives in, and as a part of solutions to economic and social problems.

Individualism, greed, wastefulness, and self-interest can lead to conflict and foster an environment where the strong overpower the weak. Therefore, a self-centered system is inadequate for ensuring social peace and maintaining economic balance among different social groups.

M. Fethullah Gülen and his followers implemented and institutionalized the theoretical views of Nursî on a global scale. The following section will provide a more detailed discussion of this topic.

8. Contributions of M. Fethullah Gülen and The Hizmet Movement

Said Nursî manifested pioneering but relatively theoretical approaches because the conditions of the period he lived in did not allow him to put his ideas into practice. M. Fethullah Gülen (1938-2024) and his followers are putting Nursî's ideas into practice, institutionalizing them and significantly realizing the global dissemination of these concepts and institutions. In this regard, should we see Gülen as a ‘development guru’ and accept the movement in his leadership as a development model? I will focus on these ideas in the next section.

8.1. Why should the Movement be Defined as a Development Model?

The Hizmet Movement is globally unique in many respects such as its emergence, development and sphere of influence, the quality of its human resources, the unique approaches, and its multidimensional structure.

As a religious leader, M. Fethullah Gülen defines all legitimate and legal activities carried out to improve education and the economy, ensure unity and solidarity in society, and strengthen the country as a kind of ‘worship’ (Gülen 2011-a). This is a critical point because Gülen interprets the worship concept here as wide and multidimensional. In addition, Gülen might be the only Muslim religious leader who has expressed this opinion.

Based on this approach, the volunteers of the movement have traveled to over 160 countries. In each location, they have engaged in various activities aimed at supporting the human and economic development of the national and local communities. By building schools, universities, research institutes, language courses, associations and foundations (dialogue, humanitarian organizations, business and trade, etc.), and media institutions, publishing periodicals and books, they aim to prevent conflicts and build social peace, supporting pluralism and democratic development, preventing radicalization, increasing the level of education, awareness in society and the schooling rate of girls, developing the talents of young people, etc. (e.g. Lacey 2014, Fontenot and Fontenot 2009, Arslan 2014, Uygur 2014, Michel 2014, Keles et al. 2019). The effectiveness of institutions in regions with intense social divisions and conflicts, such as Bosnia-Herzegovina, Pakistan, Nepal, India and some African countries, is a prime example of this situation (Ateş et al. 2005).

Examining the work of the Hizmet Movement in various countries clearly reveals that these activities form a foundation for development. All functions, activities, and institutions of the movement, such as education, production and trade development, conflict prevention, are developed and institutionalized forms of the main approaches of Said Nursî.

In the literature, many scientific studies have previously examined the Hizmet Movement from different perspectives such as educational contributions, civil society, democracy, dialogue, sociological dimensions and effects, religious ideas and practices, political approaches and dimensions, the divergence of civil Islam and political Islam, etc. (e.g. Carroll 2008, Fontenot and Fontenot 2009, Yilmaz and Esposito 2010, Lacey 2014, Arslan 2014, Uygur 2014, Michel 2014, Dreher 2014, Dreher 2016-a, Fitzgerald 2017, Keles et al. 2019, Sancı and Kardaş 2020, Weller 2022, Soltes 2024, Pahl 2024, Maloku 2024).

The economic aspects and impacts of the Hizmet Movement are among the fewest investigated topics. In one of the limited papers, Pahl (2024) shows how communities such as the Hizmet Movement can contribute to an economic system beyond socialism and capitalism. He explains how spiritually-grounded social enterprise can be a part of long-term solutions to economic crises. In this paper, he defines the Hizmet Movement as a social enterprise with wide effects.

Uygur (2014) defines ‘Islamic Puritanism’ as a source of economic development and investigates the contributions of the Hizmet Movement in this context. He directly connects the Hizmet Movement to economic development, focusing on life goals and ways of living, and discusses the Hizmet Movement's contribution to the lifestyle related to economic activities. Additionally, he examines the institutional and moral foundations that foster an entrepreneurial culture within the context of the Hizmet Movement.

Dreher (2015) develops an alternative approach for the Islamic business ethic in the context of the Hizmet Movement. She argues that although the Hizmet Movement has made significant contributions through the concept of corporate social responsibility, issues of gender and labor rights need to be addressed carefully.

Gülen (2011-b) describes this movement as "a movement that composes its own examples." This definition encouraged me to investigate this movement as an independent model for economic development. All papers about the movement enhanced understanding of its activities, concepts, institutional structure, and impacts. However, these approaches do not cover all dimensions of the movement. Because the movement is multidimensional with broad content such as social, economic, education, culture, religion, etc. Therefore, considering it as a development model based on humanitarian values will enable a much more accurate and multidimensional analysis.

Sabine Dreher (2016-b) used the "Hizmet Development Model" concept for the first time in the literature. Dreher (2016-b) drew a similarity between the "Third Italy Model" formed by businesses and schools and the Hizmet Movement. She indicates that the Hizmet Movement fosters development through various means, including education, business, trade, dialogue, and cultural change. Dreher (2016-b) states that the Hizmet Movement established over 2.000 schools in over 160 countries worldwide until 2016 to achieve this aim. She claims that most schools consist of networks of supporters made up of volunteers and business people.

But until now, the movement has not been considered as an economic development model based on universal humanitarian values. This article in hand aims to fill this literature gap and initiate a conceptual discussion of the term 'Hizmet Development Model'. Besides this article aims to expand on previous approaches, provides a comprehensive overview of the model, defines the Hizmet Development Model based on the values as an economic development framework, and outlines all its dimensions and components.

Neither capitalism which is based on the dominance of capital and deifying private property, nor socialism which is state-oriented and destroying private property, is centered on humanitarian values. The necessity for a system that prioritizes humans and their values has never been more evident in human history. In this context, I will define the universal humanitarian values in M. Fethullah Gülen's perspective in the following section.

8.2. Definition of the Universal Humanitarian Values

M. Fethullah Gülen has addressed universal humanitarian values and emphasized their importance in many of his speeches, sermons, books, and articles (Gülen 2011-b, 2011-c, 2011-d, 2011-e, 2011-f, 2011-g, 2011-h, 2012, 2015-a).

As quoted by Mustafa Yeşil (2024) from M. Fethullah Gülen, universal humanitarian values consist of three parts:

- Religious Values: Values that come from all religions and beliefs, and are accepted by all societies in the world.
- Traditional Values: Values that come from all traditions, and are accepted by all societies in the world.
- Scientific Values: Values that come from scientific research, and are accepted by all societies in the world.

The approach of Gülen offers a comprehensive and inclusive perspective for all of humanity without excluding any person, community, nationality, belief, religion, culture, or scientific value. The movement creates its own core values based on universal humanitarian values. The next section explains these core values.

8.3. The Core Values of the Hizmet Movement

Alliance for Shared Values (AFSV), a non-profit umbrella organization that serves as a voice for civic and service organizations associated with the Hizmet social initiative in the U.S., declares 12 core values of the Hizmet Movement as follows (AFSV 2024):

- **Respect for Human Beings and Fundamental Human Rights:** Hizmet participants believe that every human being has inherent value and everyone should be treated with dignity. Every person is equal as a human being and before the law, and no one person is superior to anyone else. Hizmet participants uphold all human rights and freedoms expressed in the United Nations' Universal Declaration of Human Rights. Social justice and equal opportunity are requirements for equality among people.
- **Respect for The Rule of Law:** Hizmet participants respect the rule of law. They do not see anyone as above the law, and they act within the framework of protection of human dignity, universal legal principles, and the laws of their country of residence. They manage their organizations in a way to meet or exceed the transparency and accountability norms of their society.
- **Peaceful and Positive Action:** Hizmet is a peaceful movement. Hizmet participants reject using violence as a political tool. Hizmet participants prefer positive and constructive actions and reject hostility-driven and destructive actions.
- **Empowerment of Women:** Hizmet participants are committed to the ideal that women are provided with equal opportunity and can contribute to all aspects of society without discrimination, and they strive to meet this ideal in all activities.
- **Ethical Action:** Hizmet participants pay attention to both ethical norms and moral principles in their activities. They abide by fundamental ethical principles including honesty, trustworthiness, harmlessness, and fairness. They believe that legitimate and rightful goals should be obtained through legitimate and rightful means.
- **Respect for Diversity and Pluralism:** Hizmet participants see collective and individual diversity as richness as long as they do not contradict fundamental human rights. They adopt an attitude necessary to avoid conflicts that stem from differences in sacred beliefs.
- **Voluntary Participation and Altruism:** For Hizmet volunteers, joining activities or leaving them is a person's individual choice. Hizmet participants contribute to projects that bring to life their values and benefit humanity either through donations or volunteer work.
- **Consultation and Shared Wisdom:** Hizmet participants benefit from shared wisdom through discussions of different perspectives and opinions.
- **Civic Nature and Independence:** Hizmet is a civil society movement and acts independently. It is not an extension of a state or a political entity. Hizmet volunteers emphasize the internalization of democratic values, active citizenship and community participation, and they respect every individual's political choices. They stand against turning religion into a political ideology or making religion a tool of politics.
- **Civic Engagement and Contribution to Society:** Hizmet participants consider it a social responsibility to contribute to society and to help solve societal problems. They see themselves as part of the human family. They are sensitive toward humanity's problems and aim to serve humanity.
- **Protecting the Environment:** Hizmet participants view the earth, including its ecosystems, as a trust that must be preserved for future generations, and they contribute to protecting the environment.
- **Holistic View Toward Humanity (And Unity of The Mind and The Heart):** Human beings are both material and spiritual beings. Spiritual disciplines should be pursued

along with reason and scientific research so that their material and spiritual needs are met, and they can flourish in both dimensions.

How can this movement achieve success in every country it reaches? Because they operate based on common values accepted by humanity, build bridges for dialogue within society, create institutional structures, and emphasize coexisting as humans instead of engaging in conflict.

8.4. Institutionalization of the Values

The Hizmet Movement has built a strong institutional framework in the world. Alliance for Shared Values (AFSV 2024) declares how Hizmet values are put into practice:

- **Education:** Hizmet volunteers view education as a means to achieve societal development, peace, equality of opportunities, and social justice. Toward these goals, participants establish schools, universities, tutoring centers, student housing, courses, seminars, weekend schools, and after-school programs, among other education-focused initiatives. Educational programs are shaped according to the education curriculum standards of the country of their residence and include diverse fields such as science and social sciences, humanities, arts, sports and language instruction. They actively promote participation of people from all segments of their society in their educational activities.
- **Spiritual Nourishment and Growth:** Hizmet volunteers organize and support religious/spiritual, social, and cultural activities such as spiritual gatherings, seminars, panels, and mentorship programs that help them develop spiritually and fulfill their spiritual needs.
- **Dialogue and Peace in Society:** Hizmet volunteers organize dialogue and civic engagement activities among people of different religions, races, traditions, cultures, and worldviews. The aim of these activities is to establish societal peace, promote mutual knowledge, improve empathy and willingness to accept everyone as they are. These activities include academic events such as symposia, panels, and seminars; cultural events such as festivals, trips, and family meetings; spiritual events such as joint prayers and iftar programs; and social responsibility projects such as humanitarian relief activities.
- **Humanitarian Aid and Contribution to The Welfare of Society:** Hizmet volunteers view service to humanity as both a social responsibility and a spiritual practice. Through humanitarian aid campaigns, they provide food and shelter services to people who experience natural disasters, wars, or poverty. They provide health services to those in need through networks that healthcare professional volunteers have established. They plan their humanitarian aid and social responsibility projects in a self-sustaining way. They organize and support sustainable development projects.
- **Culture and Art:** As a universal language, art and cultural activities contribute to communication, peace, and harmony both within and between communities. They also contribute to the development and expression of personal talents and abilities. Therefore, Hizmet participants organize and support activities such as art education, art performances, and language and culture festivals.
- **Publications:** As a means of non-formal education, Hizmet participants publish journals, magazines, and books for the promotion and dissemination of universal human values such as societal peace, heart-mind integrity, and environmental awareness.

The institutions mentioned above have been established by the Hizmet Movement around the world. Moreover, the movement not only establishes institutional structures but also facilitates the spread of values by organizing scientific and intellectual conferences and workshops through these institutions. For example, in the margins of the 79th Session of the United Nations General Assembly (UNGA79), the Journalists and Writers Foundation, in

collaboration with 56 civil society organizations from 30 countries, hosted the 9th Annual SDGs Conference 2024 in New York on Wednesday, September 25, 2024 (JWF 2024).

8.5. Global Dissemination of the Institutions and the Values

Global movements, ideas, approaches, and projects are absent in the Islamic world. Instead, the movements in Islamic countries focus on regional issues, consider regional contexts, and do not have a broad perspective. However, according to Anwar Alam (2019), M. Fethullah Gülen, as a religious scholar, initiated a global social movement with religious underpinnings, marking a significant development in the history of Islamic societies.

Unlike other religious communities and leaders, Gülen has not delivered his message to people with a spiritual vision only. Instead, he has come to the forefront with his rhetoric and action on universal humanitarian values, human rights, global peace, dialog, rule of law, and democracy (Pandya and Gallagher 2012, Michel 2014, Grinell 2015, Mercan 2017).

What motivates M. Fethullah Gülen and the movement to promote and disseminate these values and institutions globally? There could be many answers to this question. However, one stands out as particularly significant in the context of this study: The Inheritors of the Earth (Gülen 2011-i).

This expression takes part in the 105th verse of the Surah Al-Anbiya (The Prophets) in the Quran: "And certainly We have written in the Zabur (Psalms) after the Reminder (Torah) that My righteous servants (Sâlihûn) shall inherit the earth." It is noteworthy that in this verse, the words believer, Muslim, people of the book, etc. do not take place. Instead of these, the verse includes the term "righteous servant (Sâlih)". The term "righteous servant (Sâlih)" in this verse means "useful, good, correct and beautiful, helpful, free from all kinds of corruption and error; peaceful, harmonious." (Çağrıçı 2009).

The term "Islâh", which comes from the same etymological root as "Sâlih", is generally used to mean "to correct, to make better" (Merad 1999). This meaning of the term "Islâh" is similar to "development". In this sense, the terms "Sâlih" and "Islâh" complement each other. Furthermore, from this perspective, the concepts of "Servant" and "Hizmet/Service" represent the embodied essence of the terms "Sâlih" and "Islâh".

The following section discusses the elements and functioning of the Hizmet Development Model by focusing on the Hizmet Movement, its main concepts, and institutional structure.

9. Hizmet Development Model

When examined from the perspective of economic development, Gülen's books, speeches, articles, and Hizmet institutions around the world reveal a comprehensive, inclusive, and detailed development model. In this section, I will present the Hizmet Development Model, drawing on various inferences and interpretations based on this perspective.

According to the perspective of Gülen (2011-j), the economic structure is fundamentally built upon the social structure. Thus, the strength of the social structure ensures the stability and resilience of the economy. In his approach, a strong and resistant social structure thrives on individuals rooted in universal humanitarian values, creating a community that genuinely supports and uplifts one another. Such a powerful social structure naturally and spontaneously helps rise to the economic system and helps to gain its functionality. A society where individuals embody these universal humanitarian values experiences minimal problems. Consequently, many economic activities and issues - e.g. production, distribution, fair income distribution, equality, and equity- are effectively managed through mechanisms rooted in humanitarian values.

Based on Gülen's approach, my own observations, and academic studies on this movement, the Hizmet Development Model in this paper consists of nine interdependent components that support and require each other: Developing internal core human abilities, organizational dedication, resource mobilization, humanitarian capacity building, institutional capacity building, fight against ignorance, fight against severe poverty, fight against conflict, and universal peace and fair income distribution and sustainability. These components derive strength from two key concepts: universal humanitarian values and the movement's core values based on them. Only if the core values are adhered to can the proper functioning and sustainability of the components be ensured.

Figure: Components of the Hizmet Development Model



The upcoming sections will delve into the essential components of the model, demonstrating how each element works together seamlessly to create a cohesive and effective system.

9.1. Developing Internal Core Human Abilities

Economic development models, from the past to the present, have primarily focused on maximizing individual interests and satisfaction. They have emphasized a consumption-oriented perspective, aiming to create a society centered around consumption. This approach highlights individuals who prioritize their own desires and needs above all else. In the world economy shaped by this perspective, poverty cannot be reduced and effective solutions to environmental problems cannot be found. In addition, conflicts and wars are key issues that dominate the agenda.

As mentioned in section 4, discovering and developing a person's physical and mental talents is crucial for enhancing their productivity, innovation, and creativity within economic and social life. However, in this process, abilities related to the values that make a person human also need to be discovered and developed. Otherwise, models based on humans—defined as beings that think like robots and perform only mathematical calculations for their own profit—will be unable to explain reality if they do not consider emotional, moral, and value-centric dimensions.

The values put forward by Gülen and which have become a part of humanity should be effectively included and adopted in the education system. Gülen, who educated his own students in the context of humanitarian values throughout his life, advocated and encouraged the institutionalization of an education equipped and enriched with these values (Ateş et al. 2005, Alam 2019, Pahl 2019, Weller 2022, Soltes 2022).

According to Ünsal (2010), Gülen believes that education plays the primary role in achieving the values that make a person a real human being. According to him, education is the most beautiful way to embrace the whole life and also it has the most important role in disseminating harmony, balance, discipline, and order in individual and social life. According to Gülen's belief, the best person is someone who helps others the most (Ünsal 2010).

What kind of social structure can Gülen's ideal education system establish based on universal humanitarian values? Robinson (2009) gives us an answer:

“The Gülen Movement offers an adequate and efficient plan for the formation of a healthier, more civilized society in the global context by teaching moral and social values to young people in terms of social, educational and religious aspects. Children who are educated with a global perspective and a sincere and humanitarian concern to distinguish right from wrong build a sincere hope for a peaceful future. A commitment to building standards of moral and social values for children can be a solution to future conflicts and develop a global attitude.”

But this is easier said than done. Gülen devoted his entire life to promoting his ideals, his followers also traveled to many countries around the world to realize these ideals with unprecedented dedication (Pahl 2019). They established thousands of schools, universities, institutes, dialogue and education associations, language courses, media institutions, and publishing companies.

Explaining why a large group of people abandon their own interests to work for very low wages and pursue specific ideals in various countries, including underdeveloped regions with low living standards, is not easy. In this context, Gülen's charismatic leadership and the motivation he generates through new concepts are truly unique (some of them here, but not limited to): so others may live (Gülen 1995, Kurt 2013), a movement that composes its own examples (Gülen 2011-b), active patience (Gülen 2020), - inspired by Said Nursî - positive action (Gülen 2005-a, Pahl 2019), peace island (Gülen 2004), having no expectation in return (Gülen 2015-d), accept people as they are (Gülen 2021-a, 2021-b), altruism (Gülen 2015-b), dedication (Gülen 2015-c), etc.

Ebaugh (2010) identifies two interrelated concepts that support the success of the movement both in Turkey and at the international level: Organizational commitment/dedication and resource mobilization. The next two sections focus on these concepts.

9.2. Organizational Commitment / Dedication

According to Ebaugh (2010), organizational commitment/dedication refers to the strategies implemented by the movement to motivate individuals to obtain the necessary resources and the organizational commitment mechanisms that will ensure loyalty to the movement and ensure its vitality and growth.

Throughout history, one of the key characteristics of influential individuals has been their ability to move beyond self-centeredness and create things that benefit others or society. In other words, those who have a purpose greater than mere self-satisfaction have had a significant impact. Gülen also lived his whole life and encouraged his followers in this direction (Kurt 2013).

The approach of Nursî (1911), “for a person’s value is relative to his endeavour. If a person’s endeavour is his nation, that person forms a miniature nation on his own”, in Gülen's ideas and practices have evolved into a broader, understanding of encompassing humanity, and institutional structures working towards this end. Gülen (2019) says;

“The real, profound worth of life is revealed when one’s life is dedicated to the well-being of humanity. (...) Centering life around such an ideal renders one’s life many times more fruitful.”

When examining commitment/dedication, personal and organizational characteristics that increase the willingness to exert a high level of effort and the desire to remain a member of the movement and embrace its core goals and values are evaluated together (Ebaugh 2010). According to Ebaugh (2010), the committed/dedicated person is loyal and adheres. Gülen (2010, 2015-a) frequently emphasizes commitment and dedication in his writings and preaches and encourages the followers in this direction. These characteristics are prominently observed among members of the Hizmet Movement (Ebaugh 2010, Pahl 2019, Soltes 2022).

9.3. Resource Mobilization

For a social movement to be successful, it must have the following resources: money, legitimacy, and effort (Ebaugh 2010). Besides Ebaugh (2010) explains that resource mobilization sheds light on the economic and human resources that grow a movement and enable it to succeed in achieving its goals. El-Banna (2014) also provides detailed information on how it draws on Islamic resources, how it should be classified, and how it differs from other social movements.

One of the most important resource mobilization mechanisms is “himmət / amicable-kind help”. The concept of “himmət” also has deep mystical meanings. However, "himmət" here also includes the meanings of "to be kind, to help, to come to the rescue, and to lend a hand" and “to turn towards, to resolve, and to turn towards a blessed work with sincere intention” (Gülen 2005-b). Gülen (2011-k) considered "himmət" as the donations that devotees make from their own income for the sake of Allah, by making sacrifices, so that future generations can receive a better education and be equipped with universal humanitarian values, solidarity for the communities, health institutions and humanitarian aid for poor people, etc.

The concept of "himmət" holds significant importance in the foundations of the institutions established by the Hizmet Movement across various countries. Business people, tradesmen, entrepreneurs, even civil servants and workers devoted to the movement have voluntarily donated a portion of their monthly or annual income to Hizmet institutions in many countries worldwide (Uygur 2014, Dreher 2015, Alam 2019, Pahl 2019). Alam (2019) defines them as a

part of the concept of “Anatolian Tigers”. They have combined altruism, commitment, and dedication in their life. The umbrella organization of the business people and companies connected to the Hizmet Movement was The Turkish Confederation of Businessmen and Industrialists (TUSKON) in Turkey. It had branches in many countries. Now the World Investment and Trade Organization (WITO)¹ works for the same aim worldwide.

Dreher (2016-b) emphasizes that schools are crucial for the movement because they increase the number of adherents and provide a stable market for the businesses connected to the movement.

9.4. Humanitarian Capacity Building

Implementing the steps outlined above will educate the population, help them internalize universal humanitarian values, promote peace, and reduce the likelihood of conflicts. Achieving this goal will enhance the humanitarian capacity of that country or region. According to Dreher (2016-b), the Hizmet Movement established over 2.000 schools in over 160 countries worldwide until 2016 to achieve this aim.

Over time, these countries or regions will manage this process independently and using their own human resources. Without the need for people to come from outside to work in the institutions, employees who are trained in that country start to take on duties. In this way, countries or regions mobilize their own human resources.

Countries that can effectively mobilize adequate human resources begin to offer support to other nations. A few examples among thousands: a teacher from Madagascar works at a Hizmet institution in Kyrgyzstan, a Romanian administrator serves as the principal of a charter school in the United States, and so on. Participation in this process is entirely voluntary.

9.5. Institutional Capacity Building

Success in humanitarian capacity building can lead to a corresponding increase in institutional capacity. As individuals enhance their qualifications and prioritize human values, they contribute to the establishment of effective institutional structures. This, in turn, helps these institutions become sustainable and internationally recognized. The cooperation of the Hizmet institutions among themselves and with other international organizations globally can be considered the most important output of this stage.

This strong corporate network, interaction, and learning process can bring many positive results on a national and global scale. The fight against ignorance, extreme poverty, and conflict is carried out through institutions driven by universal humanitarian values.

9.6. Fight Against Ignorance

The fight against ignorance, which Said Nursî placed at the forefront, is a multifaceted problem that can be solved step by step on a national and global scale, depending on the development of humanitarian and institutional capacity.

According to Çağrıçı (1993), ignorance extends beyond alphabetical literacy in Islamic literature; it encompasses respect for humanity, other living beings, the environment, and fundamental human values. It involves acting with integrity and maintaining good manners in our interactions with others (Çağrıçı 1993). With these dimensions, the fight against ignorance is crucial in pursuing knowledge, justice, and progress in society.

Society can overcome the barriers ignorance creates by promoting education based on universal humanitarian values, encouraging critical thinking, eliminating misinformation, and fostering

¹ Please visit the website: <https://witorganization.org/>

empathy and understanding. Overcoming ignorance is necessary to ensure a more informed, enlightened, and fair world.

The Hizmet movement establishes educational institutions based on humanitarian values worldwide, including schools (from kindergarten to high school), universities, preparation courses, study (etude) centers for students, international media institutions, and publishing companies (Ergil 2010, Pahl 2019, Soltes 2022). The movement conducts informative seminars, conferences, and local reading groups open to all education levels and perspectives. This is a comprehensive effort to combat ignorance.

9.7. Fight Against Severe Poverty

Poverty is the result of a combination of individual, societal, and global factors. Poverty is not caused by a single issue but rather by a web of interrelated factors that prevent individuals or communities from accessing the resources needed to achieve a decent standard of living. It is not simply the lack of income but also the inability to access resources such as education, healthcare, social protection, and opportunities for advancement. Addressing poverty requires comprehensive strategies that tackle the root causes, promote economic inclusion, and ensure that resources are equitably distributed. Solutions must involve both local efforts to improve individual lives and broader systemic changes to address structural inequalities. It is essential to address both the immediate needs of individuals living in poverty and the long-term structural factors that perpetuate it.

The Hizmet Movement carries out extensive humanitarian aid activities (food aid, clean-water access, healthcare, disaster response, vocational training courses, etc.) through its global humanitarian organizations (e.g. former “Kimse Yok mu?” and now “Time to Help EU Association”² based in Germany) to support people living in extreme poverty.

Additionally, it helps support the uneducated and those who are potentially or currently unemployed by providing access to vocational training and educational institutions, enabling them to acquire skills and earn an income. Because enhancing education and awareness in society greatly aids the fight against poverty (Ateş et al. 2005).

Additionally, healthcare institutions of the Hizmet Movement provide free medical services, surgeries, and medications for low-income individuals, as they often struggle to access healthcare.

Another dimension of poverty is the difficulties experienced in production and trade. For this reason, the Hizmet movement encouraged volunteer business persons to go to every country it went to (Uygur 2014, Alam 2019). In this way, it is aimed to contribute to the development of production and trade and the reduction of poverty. These dedicated business persons also play a crucial role in financing the Hizmet institutions.

9.8. Fight Against Conflict

Social conflict in a country can arise from a variety of sources, often involving tensions between different groups within society. These conflicts are typically rooted in issues of inequality, injustice, and competition for resources, as well as differences in identity, values, and interests.

The fight against ignorance and poverty, and growing the number of people who have value-centered humanitarian understanding, play a vital role in preventing social conflicts. But these are not enough. In this context, the Hizmet movement focuses on dialog (Pahl 2019, Soltes 2022), tolerance (Tyler 2008), peace-building (Pahl 2019), positive and non-aggressive action (Gurbuz and Purkayastha 2008), and contributes to democratic processes in the countries. The Abant Platform, a dialog platform of the Journalists and Writers Foundation in Turkey, was one

² Please visit the website: <https://timetohelp.eu/>

of the notable and influential samples of these contributions (to read the final declarations of the platform meetings see also: Abant Platform 2016).

While Gülen clearly and strongly rejected Huntington's thesis on the Clash of Civilizations (Penaskovic 2008) and terrorism (Wright 2008), he distanced himself and his followers from movements such as political Islam or the politicization of Islam (Ergil 2010, Ergene 2009). He says "Islam cannot promote or tolerate terrorism" (Ebaugh 2010) and "a Muslim cannot be a terrorist, and a terrorist cannot be a Muslim" (Gülen 2001).

By doing all these activities, the movement aims to create "peace islands" for all individuals who wish to live in a harmonious world, living and operating in a multidimensional manner.

9.9. Universal Peace, Fair Income Distribution and Sustainability

Achieving universal peace requires a comprehensive approach that centers around value-based education and the establishment of resilient institutions dedicated to fostering harmony. This involves not only ensuring that educational opportunities are accessible to all, irrespective of socio-economic status but also dismantling the barriers that prevent individuals from pursuing learning. Additionally, addressing the root causes of poverty is crucial, as economic disparity often fuels conflict and unrest.

Cultivating well-educated individuals who are equipped with the knowledge and skills to understand and navigate social complexities is paramount. These educated individuals can contribute to institutions that actively promote peace, serve as mediators in conflicts, and encourage dialogue and understanding among diverse communities. By investing in the areas—value-centric education, poverty reduction, and eliminating conflict—we can lay the foundation for a more peaceful and just society.

In a society characterized by a high level of education and a strong commitment to ethical and humanitarian values, individuals are less likely to engage in criminal activities such as corruption, theft, violence, etc. When such morally grounded citizens take on administrative roles, it is anticipated that income distribution will become more equitable. In this ideal framework, personal interests and self-centered behaviors are supplanted by a collective focus on values that promote fairness and responsibility.

As these value-centric individuals steer the societal and economic landscape, a natural and organic process toward fair income distribution can occur. This transformation is not solely reliant on individual actions; rather, it is also shaped significantly by government policies and initiatives. Effective governance plays a crucial role in fostering an environment where equitable practices can thrive, thereby enhancing society's overall well-being. The collaborative effort between the values of the populace and the legislative actions of the government can create a harmonious ecosystem conducive to fair income distribution and social justice.

The promotion of value-centric development emphasizes the importance of fostering a deep respect and awareness for individuals, communities, and the natural environment. This approach not only prioritizes economic growth but also ensures that social equity and environmental preservation are integral to the development process. By aligning economic objectives with social responsibility and ecological sustainability, value-centric development creates a holistic framework that seeks to achieve long-term benefits for all stakeholders involved. Ultimately, this model aims to create harmonious interactions between human activities and the planet, ensuring that future generations can thrive in a balanced and sustainable world.

Upon achieving these goals, human and financial resources can be allocated to feed the first goal, ensuring the circle's successful continuation. By considering and partially modifying Gülen's approaches (Gülen 2018-b) in the context of the paper, I define this process as the "Sâlih

Development Circle". The term "Sâlih Development Circle" creates a powerful argument against the "vicious circle" of current economic development models.

10. Conclusion

From a historical perspective, Said Nursi's relatively theoretical approach has been put into practice in many countries by M. Fethullah Gülen and the Hizmet Movement. In this process, Gülen and the Movement have created a human resource equipped with universal human values, and a strong institutional structure.

In this paper, in light of my previous experience and observations, ideas of M. Fethullah Gülen and Said Nursî, and the information obtained from existing publications on M.F. Gülen and the Hizmet Movement, I define the Hizmet Development Model based on universal humanitarian values and outline its conceptual roots, framework, and components. I described a new development model by combining the foundations of the term 'develop(-ment)' and the approach of universal humanitarian values of Gülen.

Current development models, particularly those prevalent in capitalist economies, are often based on the principle of increasing consumption as a measure of progress. These models prioritize economic growth driven by the expansion of markets, the constant production of goods and services, and the assumption that more consumption equals more prosperity, happiness, and a peaceful environment. This results in a vicious cycle where the economy's success is gauged by the amount of goods and services produced and consumed, rather than by broader measures of well-being, environmental sustainability, less inequality, social equity and justice.

The consumption-driven approach assumes that an increase in material wealth leads to a better quality of life. However, it often ignores the complexities of human happiness, the social fabric, and the ecological impacts of overconsumption. For instance, this model fuels the depletion of natural resources, contributes to environmental degradation, and exacerbates inequality.

These models assume that people act based on rational self-interest, usually framed as maximizing their own wealth or consumption. This is rooted in classical economic theory, which posits that individuals make decisions that best serve their personal needs and desires. This assumption underpins many aspects of neoliberal policy, where markets are seen as self-regulating systems that reward individual initiative and entrepreneurship.

However, this view of human behavior oversimplifies the complexities of human motivations. People are often influenced by a mix of social, cultural, ethical, and environmental values that go beyond mere material gain. Social norms, community bonds, moral considerations, and empathy also play a significant role in decision-making. By reducing human behavior to simple self-interest, development models risk disregarding the importance of these values, which could lead to outcomes that are detrimental to society as a whole, such as increased inequality or environmental harm.

The idea that people are devoid of values speaks to the reductionist nature of many current economic development frameworks in these models. They often assume that values like justice, equity, and environmental stewardship are less important than the primary goal of economic growth and consumption. These models tend to overlook the ethical dimensions of development, assuming that the best path to progress is solely through economic and material accumulation.

By disregarding values, these models fail to recognize the importance of social well-being and long-term sustainability. For example, economic policies that prioritize profit maximization might incentivize exploitative labor practices, environmental destruction, or the concentration

of wealth in the hands of a few. These outcomes are not just the result of individual choices but are deeply shaped by the structures and values that underpin the development system itself.

To address the limitations of consumption-driven, value-neutral development models, I introduced an alternative approach based on a living archetype (The Hizmet Movement) in this paper. The Hizmet Development Model is based on universal humanitarian values such as religious, traditional, and scientific. The Hizmet Movement has transformed universal human values into core values by interpreting them within the framework of its own ideals.

The Movement, which directs all its institutions and human resources globally around these core values, deserves to be defined as a development model when the conceptual framework it has produced, the institutions it has created, the traditions formed within the community, and its long-standing experiences are considered.

This model consists of nine interdependent components: Developing internal core human abilities, organizational dedication, resource mobilization, humanitarian capacity building, institutional capacity building, fight against ignorance, fight against severe poverty, fight against conflict, and universal peace and fair income distribution. While these components support and require each other, the last phase of the model supports and creates the first phase (developing internal core human abilities) again. In this regard, Gülen's term 'Salih Circle' has come to life with a different approach in this model as 'Salih Development Circle'.

The model seeks to build a prosperous, sustainable, and peaceful world by embracing all people through humanitarian values. This encompasses education, health, the fight against poverty and ignorance, and the reduction of conflicts.

Finally, I should point out that this model does not propose a utopia as 'the City of the Sun' of Tommaso Campanella. It is real because there are examples that have been lived before and are still being experienced.

11. Further Research

Future research could explore the impact of each component of the Hizmet Development Model on development processes (regional, country, or international level) in greater detail, incorporating specific examples, and quantitative and qualitative research methodologies.

Therefore, future research could improve understanding of the model by providing more detailed real-life examples and results from qualitative research methods, such as interviews with members of the movement.

The contribution of the components in the model to economic development should be empirically examined using quantitative research methods and statistics. It would be useful to measure the contributions of the Hizmet Movement to the development process and compare them with the theoretical model I have proposed in this paper.

Besides, this model can also offer insights into the countries typically considered developed. While these nations are often seen as prosperous, they can still face significant issues such as rising inequality, populism, racism hidden poverty, migration, the challenges of maintaining social mobility, etc. By highlighting these challenges, the model can help shift focus away from purely GDP-driven measures of success and encourage a more holistic view of development, which accounts for both the material and intangible aspects of social well-being. In turn, this can lead to more comprehensive policy solutions.

References

- Abant Platform (1998-2016). <http://fgulen.com/en/fethullah-gulens-life-en/the-abant-platform-en> , Accessed on: March 25th, 2024.
- AFSV - Alliance for Shared Values (2024). Core Values of the Hizmet Movement. <https://afsv.org/hizmetcorevalues/>
- Alam, A. (2019). For the Sake of Allah: The Origin, Development and Discourse of the Gulen Movement. Blue Dome Press, NJ, USA. ISBN: 978-1-68206-6.
- Arslan, F. (2014) "The Hizmet Movement of Canada's Limitations and Weaknesses for a Healthy Dialogue," Consensus: Volume 35: Issue 1, Article 5. Available at: <http://scholars.wlu.ca/consensus/vol35/iss1/5>
- Ateş, T., Karakas, E. & Ortaylı, I. (2005). Barış Köprüleri - Dünyaya Açılan Türk Okulları. Ufuk Kitapları, İstanbul, Türkiye.
- Atkinson, A. B. (2009). Economics as a Moral Science. *Economica*, 76, 791–804. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40268906>
- Bardhan, P. (1985). Marxist Ideas in Development Economics: A Brief Evaluation. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 20(13), 550–555. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/4374227>
- Baudrillard, J. (1998). *The Consumer Society: Myths and Structures*. SAGE Publications Ltd. London, UK. ISBN: 0 7619 5691 3.
- Beaudreau, B. C. (2012). A humanistic theory of economic behavior. *The Journal of Socio-Economics*, Volume 41, Issue 2. pp. 222-234. ISSN 1053-5357. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socec.2011.12.002>
- Becker, G. (1993) [1964]. *Human capital: a theoretical and empirical analysis, with special reference to education* (3rd ed.). Chicago: The University of Chicago Press. ISBN 9780226041209.
- Boettke, P., Candela, R. A., & Truitt, T. L. (2024). *The Socialist Calculation Debate: Theory, History, and Contemporary Relevance*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Boulding, K. E. (1966). The Economics of the Coming Spaceship Earth. In "Environmental Quality in a Growing Economy" (Editor H. Jarrett), pp. 3-14. Baltimore, MD: Resources for the Future/Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Bowen, H. R. (1972). Toward a Humanist Economics. *Nebraska Journal of Economics and Business*, 11(4), 9–24. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40472426>
- Brundtland Commission (1987). *Report of the World Commission on Environment and Development: Our Common Future*. <https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/5987our-common-future.pdf>
- Brzeziński, Z. K. (1993). *Out of Control: Global Turmoil on the Eve of the Twenty-First Century*. Publisher: Charles Scribner's Sons; First Edition. ISBN-13: 978-0684196305.
- Brzeziński, Z. K. (1998). *The Grand Chessboard: American Primacy and Its Geostrategic Imperatives*. Publisher: Basic Books. ISBN-13: 978-0465027262.
- Carroll, B. J. (2008). *A Dialogue of Civilizations: Gulen's Islamic Ideals and Humanistic Discourse*. Paramus Publishing. ISBN 13: 9781597841108.
- Casagrande, S. (2023). *Human Economics: Paradigms, Systems, and Dynamics* (1st ed.). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003146599>

- Chenery, H. (1979). Structural change and development policy. A World Bank research publication Washington, D.C.: World Bank Group. Oxford University Press.
<http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/147291468331145843/Structural-change-and-development-policy>
- Çağrı, M. (1993). "Cehâlet", TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi, Vol. 7, pp.218-219.
<https://islamansiklopedisi.org.tr/cehalet> , Accessed on December 30th, 2024.
- Çağrı, M. (2009). "Sâlih". TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi. TDV İslâm Araştırmaları Merkezi.
<https://islamansiklopedisi.org.tr/salih>. Access date: 26.12.2024.
- de Janvry, A., & Sadoulet, E. (2021). Development Economics: Theory and Practice (2nd ed.). Routledge. New York, USA. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003024545>
- Dreher, S. (2014). What is the Hizmet Movement? Contending Approaches to the Analysis of Religious Activists in World Politics. *Sociology of Islam*, 1(3-4), 257-275.
<https://doi.org/10.1163/22131418-00104008>
- Dreher, S. (2015). Islamic Capitalism? The Turkish Hizmet Business Community Network in a Global Economy. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 129(4), 823–832.
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/24702979>
- Dreher, S. (2016-a). "Religion and International Political Economy – A Case of Mutual Neglect". pp.1-19. In: Religious Activism in the Global Economy: Promoting, Reforming, or Resisting Neoliberal Globalization? (Editors: Sabine Dreher and Peter J. Smith). Rowman & Littlefield International Ltd. ISBN-13: 978-1-78348697-7. London, UK.
- Dreher, S. (2016-b). "Globalization Project of the Hizmet Movement". pp.109-128. In: Religious Activism in the Global Economy: Promoting, Reforming, or Resisting Neoliberal Globalization? (Editors: Sabine Dreher and Peter J. Smith). Rowman & Littlefield International Ltd. ISBN-13: 978-1-78348697-7. London, UK.
- Dussel, E. (1993). Eurocentrism and Modernity (Introduction to the Frankfurt Lectures). *Boundary 2*, 20(3), 65–76. <https://doi.org/10.2307/303341>
- Ebaugh, H. R. (2010). The Gülen Movement: A Sociological Analysis of a Civic Movement Rooted in Moderate Islam. Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg London New York. ISBN 978-1-4020-9893-2. DOI 10.1007/978-1-4020-9894-9.
- El-Banna, S. (2014). Resource Mobilization in Gülen-Inspired Hizmet: A New Type of Social Movement. Blue Dome Press. ISBN-13: 978-1935295440. New Jersey, USA.
- Ellen MacArthur Foundation, Towards the circular economy Vol. 1: an economic and business rationale for an accelerated transition (2013).
- Elliott, Cara A. (2011) "Friedrich von Hayek: The Socialist-Calculation Debate, Knowledge Arguments, And Modern Economic Development," Gettysburg Economic Review: Vol. 5, Article 6. Available at: <https://cupola.gettysburg.edu/ger/vol5/iss1/6>
- Ergene, E. (2009). Tradition Witnessing the Modern Age. Tughra Book. ISBN: 978-1597841283.
- Ergil, D. (2010). Fethullah Gülen and the Gülen Movement in 100 questions.
<https://fgulen.com/en/fethullah-gulens-life-en/fethullah-gulen-and-the-gulen-movement-in-100-questions?start=25> , accessed on: September 13th,2023.
- Farooq, M. O. (2011). Self-Interest, Homo Islamicus and Some Behavioral Assumptions in Islamic Economics and Finance. International Journal of Excellence in Islamic Banking

- and Finance, Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 52-79, January 2011, Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=1740729>
- Fitzgerald, S.T. (2017). Conceptualizing and understanding the Gülen movement. *Sociology Compass* 11:12461. <https://doi.org/10.1111/soc4.12461>
- Florida, R. (2002). "Rise of the Creative Class", New York: Basic Books.
- Fontenot, K. and Fontenot, M. J. (2009). "The Gülen Movement: Communicating Modernization, Tolerance, and Dialogue in the Islamic World." *The International Journal of the Humanities: Annual Review* 6 (12): 67-78. doi:10.18848/1447-9508/CGP/v06i12/42586.
- Frank, A. G. (1967). *Capitalism and Underdevelopment in Latin America: Historical Studies of Chile and Brazil*. Monthly Review an Independent Socialist Magazine, ISBN: 9780853450931, January 1967.
- Garrison, L. P., & Towse, A. (2017). Value-Based Pricing and Reimbursement in Personalized Healthcare: Introduction to the Basic Health Economics. *Journal of Personalized Medicine*, 7(3), 10. <https://doi.org/10.3390/jpm7030010>
- Ghosh, B. N. (1993). Karl Marx on Development and Underdevelopment. *The Indian Economic Journal*, 40(4), 13-23. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0019466219930402>
- Greenwood, D. T. and Holt, R. P. F. (2010). *Local Economic Development in the 21st Century*. M. E. Sharpe, Inc. New York, USA and London, UK. ISBN 9780765628176.
- Grinell, K. (2015). *Reflections on Reason, Religion, and Tolerance*. Blue Dome Press. ISBN: 978-1935295563.
- Gurbuz, M. and Purkayastha, B. (2008). "From Gandhi to Gülen: The Habitus of Non-Aggressive Action". Conference on Islam in the Age of Global Challenges: Alternative Perspectives of the Gülen Movement. Georgetown University, Washington, D.C. November 14-15, 2008. <https://fgulen.com/en/conference-papers-en/gulen-conference-in-washington/from-gandhi-to-gulen-the-habitus-of-non-aggressive-action> , Accessed on April 4th, 2023.
- Gurley, J. G. (1984). Marx's Contributions and their Relevance Today. *The American Economic Review*, 74(2), 110–115. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1816339>
- Gülen, M. F. (1995). "Benlik ve Bencillikle Bir Yere Varılmaz". *Yeni Ümit*. Nisan-Haziran 1995, Sayı 28. <https://fgulen.com/tr/ eserleri/kavramlar/yeni-umit-nisan-haziran-1995-sayi-28-benlik-ve-bencillikle-bir-yere-varilamaz>. Accessed on: December 29th, 2024.
- Gülen, M. F. (2001). "Müslüman Terörist Olamaz". *Kürsü Yazıları*. <https://fgulen.com/tr/ eserleri/kursu-akademi-yazilari/2001-kursuleri/musluman-terorist-olamaz> , accessed on July 12th, 2023.
- Gülen, M. F. (2004). Fethullah Gülen'in Chicago'daki Niyagara Vakfı Tarafından 10-11 Kasım 2005'te Düzenlenen "Yeni Bin Yılda Dinlerarası Diyaloga Doğru: Ortak Paydayı Bulma" Konferansına Gönderdiği Mesaj. <https://fgulen.com/tr/hayati-tr/mesajlari/Fethullah-Gulen-Fethullah-Gulenin-Chicagodaki-Niyagara-Vakfi-Tarafindan-10-11-Kasim-2005te-Duzenlenen-Yeni-Bin-Yilda-Dinlerarasi-Diyaloga-Dogru-Ortak-Paydayi-Bulma-Konferansina-Gonderdigi-Mesaj> , Accessed on: August 11th, 2024.
- Gülen, M. F. (2005-a). "The World Awaited". *The Statue of Our Souls*. <https://fgulen.com/en/fethullah-gulens-works/the-statue-of-our-souls-en/the-world-awaited> , Accessed on: November 12th, 2024.

- Gülen, M. F. (2005-b). “Himmet: Teveccüh, İnfak ve Gayret”. Kırık Testi. <https://herkul.org/kirik-testi/himmet-teveccuh-infak-ve-gayret/#:~:text=Tasavvuf%20erb%C3%A2b%C4%B1na%20g%C3%B6re%20ise%3B%20himmet,Hakk'a%20tevecc%C3%BChte%20bulunmak%20demektir>. Accessed on: September 4th, 2024.
- Gülen, M. F. (2010). “Adanmışlık Mefkûresinin Önündeki Engeller”. Kırık Testi. <https://fgulen.com/tr/eserleri/kirik-testi/adanmislik-mefkuresinin-onundeki-engeller> , Accessed on: November 13th, 2023.
- Gülen, M. F. (2011-a). Prizma 2. Nil Yayınları. Üsküdar-İSTANBUL. ISBN: 978-975-315-217-4.
- Gülen, M. F. (2011-b). Örnekleri Kendinden Bir Hareket (Çağ ve Nesil 8). Nil Yayınları. İstanbul.
- Gülen, M. F. (2011-c). Işığın Görüldüğü Ufuk (Çağ ve Nesil-7). Nil Yayınları. İstanbul.
- Gülen, M. F. (2011-d). Sükûnun Çılgınlıkları (Çağ ve Nesil-9). Nil Yayınları. İstanbul.
- Gülen, M. F. (2011-e). Gurbet Ufukları (Kırık Testi-3). Nil Yayınları. İstanbul.
- Gülen, M. F. (2011-f). Vuslat Muştusu, (Kırık Testi-8). Nil Yayınları. İstanbul.
- Gülen, M. F. (2011-g). Cemre Beklentisi (Kırık Testi-10). Nil Yayınları. İstanbul.
- Gülen, M. F. (2011-h). Kendi Dünyamıza Doğru (Ruhumuzun Heykelini Dikerken-2). Nil Yayınları. İstanbul.
- Gülen, M. F. (2011-i). Ruhumuzun Heykelini Dikerken (Ruhumuzun Heykelini Dikerken – 1). Nil Yayınları. İstanbul.
- Gülen, M. F. (2011-j). Enginliğiyle Bizim Dünyamız -İktisadî Mülâhazalar-. Nil Yayınları. İstanbul. ISBN: 978-975-315-319-5.
- Gülen, M. F. (2011-k). “Himmet”. Sızıntı. Sayı 388. Mayıs 2011, <https://fgulen.com/tr/eserleri/dergi-yazilari/sizinti-yazilari/Sizinti-Mayis-2011-Sayi-388-Himmet> , Accessed on: June 16th, 2024.
- Gülen, M. F. (2012). Yaşatma İdeali (Kırık Testi-11). Nil Yayınları. İstanbul.
- Gülen, M. F. (2015-a). Buhanlı Günler ve Ümit Atlasımız (Kırık Testi-14). Nil Yayınları. İstanbul.
- Gülen, M. F. (2015-b). “Spirit of altruism”. The Broken Jug. <https://fgulen.com/en/fethullah-gulens-works/the-broken-jug-en/spirit-of-altruism> Accessed on: December 29th, 2024.
- Gülen, M. F. (2015-c). “Attaining immensity of thought”. The Broken Jug. <https://fgulen.com/en/fethullah-gulens-works/the-broken-jug-en/attaining-immensity-of-thought> , Accessed on: October 17th, 2024.
- Gülen, M. F. (2015-d) “The greatest credit for journeyers of guidance: Having no expectation in return”. The Broken Jug. <https://fgulen.com/en/fethullah-gulens-works/the-broken-jug-en/the-greatest-credit-for-journeyers-of-guidance-having-no-expectation-in-return> , Accessed on: September 3rd, 2024.
- Gülen, M. F. (2018-a). İnsanlık Kalesinin Tamiri. Bamteli, Herkul. <https://herkul.org/bamteli/bamteli-insanlik-kalesinin-tamiri/> , July 29th, 2018.
- Gülen, M. F. (2018-b). “En Güzel’e Giden Yol”. Kırık Testi. <https://herkul.org/kirik-testi/kirik-testi-en-guzele-giden-yol/> , accessed on: July 26th, 2024.

- Gülen, M. F. (2019). "So Others May Live". The Fountain Magazine. Issue: 132 (November - December 2019). <https://fountainmagazine.com/all-issues/2019/issue-132-nov-dec-2019/so-others-may-live>
- Gülen, M. F. (2020). "Searching for Our Souls". <https://fgulen.com/en/recent-articles-en/searching-for-our-souls> , Accessed on: October 19th, 2024.
- Gülen, M. F. (2021-a). "The Tomorrows of My Dreams". <https://fgulen.com/en/?view=article&id=53617:the-tomorrows-of-my-dreams&catid=1359> , Accessed on: October 2nd, 2024.
- Gülen, M. F. (2021-b). "In the Presence of the All-Compassionate". <https://fgulen.com/en/?view=article&id=53614:in-the-presence-of-the-all-compassionate&catid=1359> , Accessed on: October 5th, 2024.
- Hallaq, W. B. (2014). *The Impossible State: Islam, Politics, and Modernity's Moral Predicament*. Columbia University Press. ISBN: 978-0231162579.
- Hallaq, W. B. (2018). *Restating Orientalism: A Critique of Modern Knowledge*. Columbia University Press. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.7312/hall18762>
- Hansen, H. K. (2007). *Technology, Talent and Tolerance - The Geography of the Creative Class in Sweden*. (RAPPORTER OCH NOTISER; Vol. 169). Department of Social and Economic Geography, Lund University.
- Hirschman, A. O. (1981). *The Rise and Decline of Development Economics*. *Essays in Trespassing: Economics to Politics to Beyond*. pp. 1–24.
- Joseph, G. G., Reddy, V., & Searle-Chatterjee, M. (1990). Eurocentrism in the social sciences. *Race & Class*, 31(4), 1-26. <https://doi.org/10.1177/030639689003100401>
- JWF - The Journalists and Writers Foundation (2024). *SDGs Conference 2024*. <https://jwf.org/sdgs-conference-2024/jwf-2024-events/>
- Keles, O., Sezgin, I.M. and Yilmaz, I. (2019). Tackling the Twin Threats of Islamophobia and Puritanical Islamist Extremism: Case Study of the Hizmet Movement. In: Esposito, J., Iner, D. (eds) *Islamophobia and Radicalization*. Palgrave Macmillan, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-95237-6_14
- Keynes, J. M. (1936). *The General Theory of Employment Interest and Money*. Palgrave Macmillan, UK.
- Keynes, J.M. (1931). *Essays in Persuasion*. The Royal Economic Society, UK.
- Khan, S.R. (2019). *Development Economics: A Critical Introduction* (1st ed.). Routledge. New York, USA. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315226033>
- Khan, M.A. (1994). *An Introduction to Islamic Economics*. The International Institute of Islamic Thought, Islamabad – Pakistan.
- Klamer, A. (2016). The value-based approach to cultural economics. *J Cult Econ* 40, 365–373. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10824-016-9283-8>
- Klamer, A. (2018). *Economics Is a Moral Science: A Value Based Approach*. In: Róna, P., Zsolnai, L. (eds) *Economic Objects and the Objects of Economics*. *Virtues and Economics*, vol 3. Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-94529-3_13
- Klamer, A. (2020). The Economy in Context: A Value-Based Approach. *Journal of Contextual Economics – Schmollers Jahrbuch*, 140(3–4), pp.287-300. <https://doi.org/10.3790/schm.140.3-4.287>

- Klamer, A. (2023). An essay on the need to redefine economics for the sake of a human economy. *The Journal of Philosophical Economics: Reflections on Economic and Social Issues*, ISSN: 1843-2298. XVI (Annual issue), pp. 162-181.
- Kubbealtı Lugatı (2023). The term: İnkişaf. <https://www.lugatim.com/s/inki%C5%9Faf>, accessed on 05.11.2023.
- Kuran, T. (1995). "Islamic Economics and the Islamic Subeconomy." *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 9 (4): 155–173. DOI: 10.1257/jep.9.4.155
- Kurt, E. M. (editor) (2013). *So That Others May Live: A Fethullah Gulen Reader*. Blue Dome Press. ISBN-13: 978-1935295204
- Lacey, J. (2014) "Turkish Islam" as "Good Islam": How the Gülen Movement Exploits Discursive Opportunities in a Post-9/11 Milieu, *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, 34:2, 95-110, DOI: 10.1080/13602004.2014.912861
- Lewis, W.A. (1954), *Economic Development with Unlimited Supplies of Labour*. The Manchester School, 22: 139-191. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9957.1954.tb00021.x>
- Locke, J. (1689). "Two Treatises of Government". <https://www.yorku.ca/comninel/courses/3025pdf/Locke.pdf>
- Maloku, F. (2024). Who can revive Islam, 'Political Islam?' or Civil Islam?. *The International Journal of Islam*. Volume 1, Issue 5. ISBN: 2572 – 5556. https://theislamicjournal.com/wp-content/uploads/2024/10/new_paper_2.pdf
- Marshall Plan - the European Recovery Program, ERP (1948). <https://www.archives.gov/milestone-documents/marshall-plan>, Accessed on: August 14th, 2023
- Martin Prosperity Institute (2009). "Ontario Competes: Performance Overview Using the 3Ts of Economic Development", Toronto.
- Marx, Karl (1867). *Das Kapital: Kritik der politischen Oekonomie*. Vol. 1: Der Produktionsprozess des Kapitals (1 ed.). Hamburg: Verlag von Otto Meissner. doi:10.3931/e-rara-25773
- Marx, Karl (1885). *Das Kapital: Kritik der politischen Oekonomie*; herausgegeben von Friedrich Engels. Vol. 2: Der Zirkulationsprozess des Kapitals (1 ed.). Hamburg: Verlag von Otto Meissner. doi:10.3931/e-rara-25620
- Marx, Karl (1894). *Das Kapital: Kritik der politischen Oekonomie*; herausgegeben von Friedrich Engels. Vol. 3: Der Gesamtprozess der kapitalistischen Produktion (1 ed.). Hamburg: Verlag von Otto Meissner. doi:10.3931/e-rara-25739
- Meier, G. M. (1984). "The Formative Period". In: *Pioneers in Development*. Edited by Gerald M. Meier and Dudley Seers. Published for The World Bank by Oxford University Press. New York, USA. ISBN 0-19-520452-2.
- Merad, A. (1999). "İslâh". TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi. TDV İslâm Araştırmaları Merkezi. <https://islamansiklopedisi.org.tr/islam#1-kavramin-icerigi-ortaya-cikisi-ve-gelismesi>. Access date: 27.12.2024
- Mercan, F. (2017). *No Return from Democracy - A Survey of Interviews with Fethullah Gulen*. Blue Dome Press. ISBN: 978-1682060179.
- Michel, T. (2014). *Peace and Dialogue in a Plural Society: Contributions of the Hizmet Movement at a Time of Global Tensions*. Blue Dome Press.

- Mirakhor, A. and Askari, H. (2015). *Islam and the Path to Human and Economic Development*. Palgrave Macmillan. ISBN 978-0-230-10388-7. New York, USA.
- Mises, Ludwig von (1922). *Die Gemeinwirtschaft: Untersuchungen über den Sozialismus*, Jena: Gustav Fischer Verlag, 1922.
- Mises, Ludwig Von (1956). *The Anti-Capitalistic Mentality*. D. Van Nostrand Company Inc. New York, USA.
- North, D. C. (1990), *Institutions, Institutional Change and Economic Performance*. Cambridge University Press, ISBN-13: 978-0521397346, Cambridge, UK.
- Novak, M. (1997). *Economics as humanism*. *First Things: A Monthly Journal of Religion and Public Life*, (76), 18+.
<https://link.gale.com/apps/doc/A19908768/AONE?u=anon~c5a96e89&sid=googleScholar&xid=ff705ea9>
- Nurkse, R. (1961). *Problems of Capital Formation in Underdeveloped Countries*. Oxford University Press, New York, USA.
- Nursî, S. (1911). *The Damascus Sermon*. Sözler Publishing. Istanbul, Turkey.
- Nursî, S. (2021). *The Flashes*. Sözler Publications. Istanbul, Turkey. ISBN-13: 978-9754323740.
- Nursî, S. (2024-a). “The Seventh Ray”. *The Rays*. The Rays. Risale Global Online Publishing. <https://risaleglobal.com/?lang=en&book=ingsualar&sec=12>
- Online Etymology Dictionary (2023-a). The term: “Develop”,
https://www.etymonline.com/word/develop#etymonline_v_8481, accessed on 05.11.2023
- Online Etymology Dictionary (2023-b). The term “Development”,
https://www.etymonline.com/word/development#etymonline_v_29650, accessed on 05.11.2023
- O’sullivan, A. and Sheffrin, S.M. (2003) *Economics: Principles in Action*. 2nd edition. Pearson Prentice Hall. Upper Saddle River, USA. ISBN-13: 978-0130634597.
- Pahl, J. (2019). *Fethullah Gülen: A Life of Hizmet – Why a Muslim Scholar in Pennsylvania Matters to the World*. Blue Dome Press. ISBN-13: 978-1682060209
- Pahl, J. (2024). *Economic Crises and the Promise of Spiritually-Grounded Social Enterprise: Building Peace through Sustainable Profits, Consistent with the Prophets, in Habitat for Humanity and the Hizmet Movement*. *The International Journal of Islam*, Volume 1, Issue 4. ISSN: 2572-5556. March 2024. <https://theislamicjournal.com/wp-content/uploads/2024/04/EconomicCrisesHabitatandHizmet-jon-Pahl.pdf>
- Pandya, S. and Gallagher, N. (as editors) (2012). *The Gulen Hizmet Movement and Its Transnational Activities*. Brown Walker Press. ISBN: 978-1612335476.
- Penaskovic, R. (2008). “Gülen's Response to the 'Clash of Civilizations' Thesis”. Conference on Islam in the Age of Global Challenges: Alternative Perspectives of the Gulen Movement. Georgetown University, Washington, D.C. November 14-15, 2008.
<https://fgulen.com/en/conference-papers-en/contributions-of-the-gulen-movement/gulens-response-to-the-clash-of-civilizations-thesis>, accessed on: May 3rd, 2023.

- Porter, M. E. and Kramer, M. R. (2011). Creating Shared Value: How to reinvent capitalism—and unleash a wave of innovation and growth. *Harvard Business Review*, January–February 2011. <https://hbr.org/2011/01/the-big-idea-creating-shared-value>
- Prebisch, R. (1950). *The Economic Development of Latin America and Its Principal Problems*. United Nations. New York, USA.
- Randmaa, M., Mouggaard, K., Howard, T. J. McAlloone, T. C. (2011). “Rethinking Value: A Value-Centric Model of Product, Service and Business Development”. In: DS 68-3: Proceedings of the 18th International Conference on Engineering Design (ICED 11), Impacting Society through Engineering Design, Vol. 3: Design Organisation and Management, Lyngby/Copenhagen (Editors: Culley, S.J.; Hicks, B.J.; McAlloone, T.C.; Howard, T.J. & Cantemessa, M.), pp: 387-396, Denmark, 15.-19.08.2011.
- Rawls, J. (1971). *A Theory of Justice: Original Edition*. Harvard University Press. <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctvjf9z6v>
- Raworth, K. (2017). *Doughnut economics: seven ways to think like a 21st century economist*. White River Junction, Vermont, Chelsea Green Publishing.
- Robinson, P. J. (2009). “Küresel Değerler Eğitiminde Ethos’u Tanımlamak”. In: Farklı Seslerin Ahengi: Gülen Hareketi – Konferanslar Serisi 1. (Editor: Seyit N. Erkal). Işık Yayınları. İzmir. ISBN 978-975-278-341-6.
- Rosenstein-Rodan, P. N. (1943). Problems of Industrialisation of Eastern and South-Eastern Europe. *The Economic Journal*, 53(210/211), 202–211. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2226317>
- Rostow, W. W. (1960). *The Stages of Economic Growth: A Non-Communist Manifesto*. Cambridge University Press. Cambridge, UK.
- Sancı, K. und Kardaş, A. (2020). “Gewaltaufrufe im frühen Islam. Zwischen Religiosität und Profanität”. pp. 43 – 84. In: *Mit Gott auf unserer Seite - Religiöse Aufrufe zur Gewalt und ihre Gegenreaktionen*“, (Eds. Johann Ev. Hafner und Hans-Michael Haußig). Ergon, Baden-Baden. ISBN print: 978-3-95650-664-2. doi.org/10.5771/9783956506659-43.
- Sandel, M. J. (2012). *What Money Can't Buy: The Moral Limits of Markets*. United Kingdom: Penguin Books Limited. ISBN: 978-0141969800
- Schumacher, E. F. (1973). *Small Is Beautiful: A Study of Economics as If People Mattered*. Blond & Briggs Ltd., London.
- Seidman, Karl F. (2005). *Economic Development Finance*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications. California, USA. ISBN 9780765628176
- Sen, A. (1999). *Development as Freedom*. Oxford University Press. ISBN-13: 978-0192893307. Oxford, UK.
- Smith, A. (1789). *An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Nations*. <https://www.econlib.org/library/Smith/smWN.html>
- Smith, V. L., & Wilson, B. J. (2019). *Humanomics: Moral sentiments and the wealth of nations for the twenty-first century*. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Soltes, O. Z. (2022). *Between Thought and Action: An Intellectual Biography of Fethullah Gülen*. Blue Dome Press. ISBN-13: 978-1682060315.
- Soltes, O. Z. (2024). *The Ramadan Fast, Jihad, and Hizmet in the World of Fethullah Gulen*. *The International Journal of Islam*, Volume 1, Issue 5. ISSN: 2572-5556. May 2024 <https://theislamicjournal.com/wp-content/uploads/2024/04/The-Ramadan-Fast-Jihad-and-Hizmet-in-the-World-of-Fethullah-Gulen2.pdf>

- Stiglitz, J. E. (2024). *The road to freedom: economics and the good society*. First edition. New York, W.W. Norton & Company.
- Todaro, M. and Smith, S. C. (2015). *Economic Development* (12th ed.). Pearson Education. ISBN-13: 978-1292002972, London, UK.
- Truman Doctrine (1947). <https://history.state.gov/milestones/1945-1952/truman-doctrine>, accessed on 05.07.2024.
- Tyler, A. (2008). "A Strategy for Peace: Gülen and the Islamic Conceptualization of Tolerance". Conference on Islam in the Age of Global Challenges: Alternative Perspectives of the Gulen Movement. Georgetown University, Washington, D.C. November 14-15, 2008. <https://fgulen.com/en/conference-papers-en/gulen-conference-in-washington/a-strategy-for-peace-gulen-and-the-islamic-conceptualization-of-tolerance> , Accessed April 8th, 2023.
- Upreti, G. (2023). Satisfaction of Human Needs and Environmental Sustainability. In: *Ecosociocentrism*. Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-41754-2_6
- Uygur, S. (2014). 'Islamic Puritanism' as a Source of Economic Development: Contributions of the Gülen Movement. *Hizmet Studies Review*, Vol. 1, No. 1, Autumn 2014. pp. 57-72.
- Ünsal, A. (2010). "Gülen's Perspective on Education: Foundations of His Ideas and Actions". Conference Title: *The Significance of Education for the Future: The Gülen Model of Education*. 19-21 October 2010 at UIN Syarif Hidayatullah State Islamic University in Jakarta-Indonesia. <https://fgulen.com/en/conference-papers-en/gulen-conference-in-indonesia/gulens-perspective-on-education-foundations-of-his-ideas-and-actions>
- Wallerstein, I. (2011). *The Modern World-System I: Capitalist Agriculture and the Origins of the European World-Economy in the Sixteenth Century* (1st ed.). University of California Press. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.1525/j.ctt1pnrj9>
- Weber, M. (1992). *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*. Routledge. ISBN 0-203-99580-5. London, UK and New York, USA.
- Weller, P. (2022). *Hizmet in Transitions: European Developments of a Turkish Muslim-Inspired Movement*. Palgrave Macmillan Cham. eBook ISBN: 978-3-030-93798-0. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-93798-0>
- Wright, S. (2008). "Ending Terror - By Words Alone?". Conference on Islam in the Age of Global Challenges: Alternative Perspectives of the Gulen Movement. Georgetown University, Washington, D.C. November 14-15, 2008. <https://fgulen.com/en/conference-papers-en/gulen-conference-in-washington/ending-terror-by-words-alone> , accessed on: May 1st,2023.
- Yeşil, M. (2024). *Hocaefendi ve Evrensel Değerler* (2024). Raindrops TV Youtube Channel- Renkler Kuşağı. <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CiBGGrziW0c> , November 30th, 2024.
- Yılmaz, I. and Esposito, J. L. (2010). "Introduction: Islam and Peacebuilding: Gülen Movement Initiatives". In: *Islam and Peacebuilding: Gülen Movement Initiatives*. Editors: John L. Esposito and İhsan Yılmaz, Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=2677923>
- Zaman, A. (2024). *The Methodology of Third Generation Islamic Economics*. The International Journal of Islam, Volume 1, Issue 4 (March 2024). ISSN: 2572-5556. <https://theislamicjournal.com/wp-content/uploads/2024/03/The-Methodology-of-Third-Generation-Islamic-Economics-1.pdf>